NOÛS

Nihil philosophici a nobis alienum putamus

Volume 6 1972

published quarterly

by INDIANA UNIVERSITY

NOÛS

Nihil philosophici a nobis alienum putamus

EDITED BY HECTOR-NERI CASTAÑEDA with the assistance of: Richard Cartwright, Massachusetts Institute of Technology; J. Michael Dunn, Indiana University; Edmund L. Gettier, III, University of Massachusetts; George Nakhnikian, Indiana University; Alvin Plantinga, Calvin College; Lawrence Powers, Wayne State University; Robert C. Sleigh, Jr., University of Massachusetts.

NOÛS publishes essays and brief discussions on philosophical problems regardless of the author's philosophical school or point of view. Papers that apply the techniques of formal logic are welcome. From time to time NOÛS will publish symposia, as well as surveys of work recently done on specially selected philosophical topics.

REVIEWS OF BOOKS are not published. Instead, NOÛS publishes critical studies of recent books and catalogues of recent publications in philosophy.

POTENTIAL CONTRIBUTORS are invited to send two copies of their manuscripts, only one of which need be a typewritten original, to the editor:

Professor Hector-Neri Castañeda, Editor
Department of Philosophy
Indiana University
Bloomington, Indiana 47401

PROSPECTIVE CONTRIBUTORS are kindly asked to prepare their manuscripts for possible publication in NOÛS in accordance with the following requests: 1. Consult the MLA Style Sheet and follow the format of similar articles in recent issues of NOÛS. 2. Collect all bibliographical items referred to in the essay in a bibliography at the end of the article. 3. Eliminate footnotes as much as possible by putting all discussion in footnotes and bibliographical references in the main body of the article. Put bibliographical references in parentheses by citing author, number of publication as it is given in the bibliography at the end of the article, year of publication, and page number. Ineliminable footnotes should be numbered consecutively and typed on separate pages after the bibliography (if any). 4. Indent long quotations without surrounding quotation marks. 5. Make sure that everything is double-spaced, including sub-headings, quotations, footnotes and bibliography.

SUBSCRIPTIONS may be ordered from:

The Secretary, NOÛS
Department of Philosophy
Indiana University
Bloomington, Indiana 47401

For *individuals* the rates are: one year, $8.00; two years, $14.50; three years, $20.00. For *bona fide students:* $5.00 per year. For *institutions:* $12.00 per year. Add 15 cents per year to Canadian subscriptions and 35 cents per year to all other foreign subscriptions.

© *1972 by Indiana University*
Application to mail at second-class postage rates is pending at Bloomington, Indiana

AUTHOR AND TITLE INDEX FOR VOLUME VI

Abraham, William E.	The Incompatibility of Individuals	1
Cartwright, Helen Morris	Chappell on Stuff and Things	369
Cocchiarella, Nino B.	Properties as Individuals in Formal Ontology	165
Fain, Haskell	The Idea of the State	15
Fisk, Milton	Relatedness Without Relations	139
Forgie, J. William	Frege's Objection to the Ontological Argument	251
Garner, Richard T.	On Saying What is True	201
Grossman, Reinhardt	Russell's Paradox and Complex Properties	153
Hintikka, Jaakko	On the Ingredients of an Aristotelian Science	55
Hintikka, Jaakko	Transcendental Arguments: Genuine and Spurious	274
Howard, V. A.	On Representational Music	41
Jubien, Michael	The Intensionality of Ontological Commitment	378
Krimsky, Sheldon	The Multiple-World Thought Experiment and Absolute Space	266
Linsky, Leonard	Two Concepts of Quantification	224
Marcus, Ruth Barcan	Quantification and Ontology	240
Meyer, Robert K.	Identity in Cocchiarella's T*	189
Pailthorp, Charles	On Refuting C. I. Lewis's Fallibilism	359
Prado, C. G.	Intentionality and Causal Analysis	281
Rosenberg, Jay F.	Russell on Negative Facts	27
Routley, R. and V.	The Semantics of First Degree Entailment	335
Schwartz, Thomas	Rationality and the Myth of the Maximum	97
Sharvy, Richard	Euthyphro 9d-11b: Analysis and Definition in Plato and Others	119
Sklar, Lawrence	Absolute Space and the Metaphysics of Theories	289
Wallace, John	Belief and Satisfaction	85
Wheeler, Samuel C.	Attributives and their Modifiers	310
RECENT PUBLICATIONS IN PHILOSOPHY		no's. 1,2,4

TOPICAL INDEX FOR VOLUME VI

Names of Contributors Are Printed in Small Caps

Absolute Space,
KRIMSKY, 266–273; SKLAR, 289–309.

Aether Theories,
SKLAR, 289–309.

Analysis,
in Plato's *Euthyphro*: SHARVY, 119–137.

Armstrong, D. M.,
on the analysis of intentionality: PRADO, 281–287.

Attributives,
and their modifiers: WHEELER, 310–334.

Austin, J.,
on locutionary and illocutionary acts: GARNER, 201–224.

Authority, political,
bases for: FAIN, 15–26.

Belief,
relational *vs.* notional senses of: WALLACE, 85–95.

Bergmann, Gustav,
his ontology: COCCHIARELLA, 165–187.

Causation, formal,
and analysis, in Plato: SHARVY, 119–137.

Chappell, V. C.,
on stuff and things: CARTWRIGHT, 369–377.

Cocchiarella, Nino B.,
his system T*: MEYER, 189–197. (See COCCHIARELLA, "Properties as Individuals in Formal Ontology", THIS VOLUME, 165, 187.)

Compossibility,
of individuals, in Leibniz: ABRAHAM, 1–13.

Concepts,
Frege on: FORGIE, 251–265.

Correspondence,
Russell on: ROSENBERG, 27–40.

Count nouns,
and substance: CARTWRIGHT, 369–377.

Decision-making,
principles of: SCHWARTZ, 97–117.

Definition,
Aristotle on the role in science of: HINTIKKA, 55–69; contextual: GROSSMAN, 163–164; in Plato's *Euthyphro*: SHARVY, 119–137.

Disjunctive Syllogism, the R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359.

Einstein, Albert,
SKLAR, 289–309.

Entailment,
semantics of first degree_____: R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359.

Existence,
as a second order property: FORGIE, 251–265.

Explanation,
teleological, and the relational sense of belief: WALLACE, 85–95.

Facts,
Russell on negative_____: ROSENBERG, 27–40.

Fallibilism,
C. I. Lewis on: FAILTHORP, 359–368.

Falsity,
and negation, Russell on: ROSENBERG, 27–40.

Frege, Gottlob,
on concepts, existence as a second-order property, the ontological argument: FORGIE, 251–265.

Goodman, Nelson,
on representation in art: HOWARD, 41–53.

Gram, M. S.,
on transcendental arguments: HINTIKKA, 274–281

Grossmann, Reinhardt,
on Russell's Paradox, on ontology: COCCHIARELLA, 165–187. (See GROSSMAN, "Russell's Paradox and Complex Properties", THIS VOLUME, 153–164).

Hare, R. M.,
on definition and analysis: SHARVY, 132–135.

Hintikka, J.,
on quantification and reference in modal contexts: LINSKY, 231–234.

Identity,
in Cocchiarella's system T*: COCCHIARELLA: 165–187; MEYER, 189–197.

Illocutionary Acts,
GARNER, 201–223.

Implication,
strict *vs.* relevant: R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359.

Indiscernibility,
and coextensiveness of properties in the system T*: COCCHIARELLA, 165–187; MEYER, 189–197.

Individuals,
Leibniz on: ABRAHAM, 1–13.

Intensionality,
of ontological committment: JUBIEN, 358–387.

Intentionality,
Armstrong's causal analysis of: PRADO, 281–287.

Kant, Immanuel,
on transcendental arguments; on the synthetic *a priori*: HINTIKKA, 274–281.

Knowledge,
C. I. Lewis on the fallibility of empirical_____: PAILTHORP, 359–368.

Leibniz, G. W.,
on compossibility of individuals, on possible worlds: ABRAHAM, 1–13; on space: SKLAR, 289–309.

Lewis, C. I.,
on empirical knowledge: PAILTHORP, 359–368.

Linsky, L.,
on substitutional quantification: MARCUS, 246–249. (See LINSKY, "Two Concepts of Quantification", THIS VOLUME, 224–239).

Locutionary Acts,
GARNER, 201–224.

Mach, Ernst,
on absolute space, absolute acceleration: KRIMSKY, 266–273; SKLAR, 289–309.

Mach's Principle,
SKLAR, 289–309.

Malcolm, N.,
on C. I. Lewis' fallibilism: PAILTHORP, 359–368.

Marcus, R. B.,
on substitutional quantification: LINSKY, 224–239.

Mass nouns,
and substance: CARTWRIGHT, 369–377.

Maximal consistency,
of sets of individuals: ABRAHAM, 1–13.

Maximization Thesis,
its rationality as a decision-making principle: SCHWARTZ, 97–117.

Moore, G. E.,
on definition and analysis: SHARVY, 132–135.

Music,
representation in: HOWARD, 41–53.

Naturalistic Fallacy, the: SHARVY, 132–135.

Negation,
classical, *vs.* _____ in systems of entailment; R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359; Russell on: ROSENBERG, 27–40.

Newton, Isaac,
on absolute space: SKLAR, 289–309.

Ontological Argument, the,
Frege on: FORGIE, 251–265.

Ontological Commitment, Quine on: JUBIEN, 378–387.

Ontology, formal, COCCHIARELLA: 165–187.

Perception,
Armstrong's causal analysis of: PRADO, 281–287; Kant on: HINTIKKA, 274–281.

Plato,
analysis and definition in : SHARVY, 119–137.

Possible worlds,
in the semantics of first degree entailment: R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359; Leibniz on: ABRAHAM, 1–13.

Preference,
theories of: SCHWARTZ, 97–117.

Properties,
complements of: ABRAHAM, 10–13; ROSENBERG, 37–39; principle of ab-

straction for: GROSSMAN: 159–164; simple *vs.* complex: GROSSMAN, 159–164; COCCHIARELLA, 179–181; reference to, and Russell's Paradox; predicative *vs.* impredicative; as individuals: COCCHIARELLA, 165–187; relational _____; as grounds of relatedness; as components of individuals: FISK, 139–151.

Property abstraction,
principle of: GROSSMAN, 153–164.

Quantification,
objectual *vs.* substitutional interpretations of: LINSKY, 224–239; MARCUS, 240–250.

Quine, W. V.,
on ontological committment: JUBIEN, 378–387; on quantification and reference: LINSKY, 224–239.

Quotation,
and substitutional quantification: LINSKY, 234–238; MARCUS, 246–249.

Rationality,
of decision making principles: SCHWARTZ, 97–117.

Reference,
and quantification: LINSKY, 224–239; MARCUS, 240–250; in music: HOWARD, 41–53.

Reichenbach, H.,
on thought experiments in physics: KRIMSKY, 266–273.

Relatedness,
grounding of, in properties: FISK, 139–151.

Relations,
as ontological grounds of relatedness: FISK, 139–151.

Relevant Implication,
R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359; FISK, 146–149.

Representation,
in music: HOWARD, 41–53.

Russell, Bertrand,
his paradox of predication, his theory of types: GROSSMAN, 153–164; COCCHIARELLA, 165–187; on negative facts: ROSENBERG, 27–40.

Russell's Paradox,
GROSSMAN, 153–164; COCCHIARELLA, 165–187; MEYER, 189–197.

Satisfaction,
and belief: WALLACE, 85–95.

Saying,
senses of; GARNER, 201–224.

Science,
Aristotle on the theoretical structure of: HINTIKKA, 55–69.

Searle, John,
on locutionary and illocutionary acts: GARNER, 218–223.

Semantics, formal,
for first degree entailment: R. & V. ROUTLEY, 335–359; for substitutional quantification: LINSKY, 224–239, MARCUS, 240–250. (Also see N. BELNAP and M. DUNN, "The Substitution Interpretation of Quantifiers", THIS JOURNAL, II, 1 (1968).)

Space,
KRIMSKY, 266–273; SKLAR, 289–309.

States, political,
criteria of individuation for; bases for relations between _____ and their citizens: FAIN, 15–26,

Stein, Howard,
on thought experiments in physics: KRIMSKY, 266–273.

Substance,
stuff: CARTWRIGHT, 369–377.

Substitution,
of definitional equivalents in causal contexts: SHARVY, 119–137.

Substitutivity,
principle of: LINSKY, 228–234.

Syllogism, the
Aristotle's theory of: HINTIKKA, 55–69.

Synonymy,
and analysis: SHARVY, 119–137.

Synthetic *a priori*, HINTIKKA, 274–281.

Theories,
ontological commitments of: JUBIEN, 378–387.

Transcendental arguments, HINTIKKA, 274–281.

Truth-conditions,
for attributive modifiers: WHEELER, 310–334.